Motion to Increase the Size of Committee on Tenure and Academic Freedom (and Clarify/Clean Up Stuff)

Mark Claypool, CTAF Chair
Len Albano, CoG Chair

November 2022 faculty meeting
Motion

The Committee on Tenure and Academic Freedom and the Committee on Governance recommend and we move that the number of members on the Committee on Tenure and Academic Freedom (CTAF) be increased from six to nine, and that the description of CTAF in the Faculty Handbook (PART ONE, Bylaw One, Subsection V) and two other related parts of the Faculty Handbook (PART ONE, Appendix A, Section D; and PART ONE, Appendix A, Section B, Subsection 2) be modified accordingly and updated, as described below.
Increase CTAF members from six to nine
Clarify selection of Chair and Secretary
Update CTAF charge for Professors of Teaching
Clarify nature of recommendations to Provost
Reorganize and edit current description of CTAF
Tenure Review

CTAF - 9

Increase Pool

CTAF - 5

DTC - 3

Joint Tenure Committee (JTC) - 8

No Change to JTC!
CTAF Tenure Review Cases per Person

- About 30 new Professors of Teaching
- About 15 more planned for this year
- Overall growth in TT faculty by about 15%
## Implementation

Starting AY 23-24 (elections Spring ‘23): Years remaining on CTAF terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Member</th>
<th>AY 2022-23</th>
<th>AY 2023-24</th>
<th>AY 2024-25</th>
<th>AY 2025-26</th>
<th>AY 2026-27</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Current slot</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current slot</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current slot</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current slot</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current slot</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current slot</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Added slot</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Added slot</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Added slot</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Bold red numbers indicate newly elected members in any year)
Rationale

Increase CTAF from 6 to 9

• Mostly meets projected peak demand
• Preserve continuity of culture and process
• Fits current university structure (e.g., 1 per department, elected members)

Clarify/Clean Up

• Clarify Chair and Secretary
• Clarify Recommendations to Provost
• Reorganize Handbook
• Update Professors of Teaching
Changes

V. The Committee on Tenure and Academic Freedom (CTAF):

*Roles and Responsibilities:*

(CTAF) is given the authority and responsibility for overseeing tenure recommendations to the Provost. The committee is in charge of the process by which tenure recommendations to the Provost are reached for each tenure-track probationary faculty member. In the case of Assistant Professors, each recommendation is either for or against tenure with promotion to Associate Professor or against tenure. In the case of Assistant Professors of Teaching, each recommendation is either for tenure with promotion to Associate Professor of Teaching or against tenure. In the cases of Associate Professors, Associate Professors of Teaching, Professors, and Professors of Teaching, each recommendation is for or against tenure with no consideration given to or recommendation made concerning promotion.
Motion to Increase the Size of Committee on Tenure and Academic Freedom (and Clarify/Clean Up Stuff)

Mark Claypool, CTAF Chair
Len Albano, CoG Chair

Thank-you for your attention!
Questions? Comments?
Alternatives Considered

• Increasing CTAF from 6 to 9
  • (Mostly) meets peak demand
  • Preserve continuity of culture and process
  • Fits current school structure (e.g., 1 per department, elected members)

• Double CTAF from 6 to 12
  • Meets peak demand, but may be larger than needed long term
  • Large committees unwieldy and harder to keep uniformity of deliberations

• Flexi-sized CTAF – expand/contract based on projected load
  • Complicated and projections can change

• School-wide CTAF – one member per department
• Ad-hoc CTAF – deputize reviewers as load demands
Changes (1 of 8)

Modifications to **PART ONE, Bylaw One, Subsection V** (shown in track changes):

V. The Committee on Tenure and Academic Freedom (CTAF):

*Roles and Responsibilities:*

(CTAF) is given the authority and responsibility for overseeing tenure recommendations to the Administration. The committee is in charge of the process by which tenure recommendations to the Provost are reached for each tenure-track probationary faculty member of the tenure-track faculty. In the case of Assistant Professors who have also been nominated for promotion to the rank of Associate Professor, the each recommendation is either for or against tenure with promotion to Associate Professor or against tenure. In the case of Assistant Professors of Teaching, each recommendation is either for tenure with promotion to Associate Professor of Teaching or against tenure. In the cases of Associate Professors, Associate Professors of Teaching, and Professors, and Professors of Teaching, the each recommendation is for or against tenure with no consideration given to or recommendation made concerning promotion.
Changes (2 of 8)

CTAF is also concerned with questions relating to academic freedom, and the committee is charged with the responsibility of reviewing problems involving the academic freedom of both tenured and non-tenured faculty members, whether part-time or full-time.

**Membership:**
CTAF consists of six-to-nine faculty members having tenure. Department Heads, the Provost, and Deans are not eligible for membership on this Committee, and there will not be more than one committee member from any one Department. The term of office for this Committee is four years. No member may serve successive terms. Department Heads, Deans, and the Provost are not eligible to serve on CTAF.
(NOTE: The following paragraph is brought in from Appendix A: Section D.)
The Chair of CTAF shall be the member whose term of office expires in June of the current academic year—has served the longest among the members in their current terms. In the case of tie in length of current service, CTAF will select the Chair from among those tied. The Chair shall rule on all matters of procedure and shall be responsible for interpreting all Faculty rules regarding tenure. The Chair's rulings are subject to review by the Faculty only. The Secretary of CTAF shall be the member aside from the Chair whose term of office expires in June of either the current or the following academic year, has served the longest among the members in their current terms. In the case of tie in length of current service, CTAF will select the Secretary from among those tied. All four members of CTAF must be present to conduct official business.
Changes (4 of 8)

Election Procedures:
Nominations and elections for CTAF are conducted by the Secretary of the Faculty. Membership on this Committee is limited to no more than one elected Faculty Member from any one academic discipline. The election procedure is as follows. The Secretary prepares a nominating ballot listing eligible Faculty Members by discipline-department and distributes it to all voting members of the Faculty, with instructions to nominate up to one person from each discipline-department. The member of each academic discipline-department who receives the largest number of nominations in their department and is willing to serve if elected is then placed on an electing-election ballot to be distributed with voting instructions to all voting members of the Faculty. In the normal pattern, the number to be elected annually will be alternately two, two, two, and one-three in successive years. Vacancies to unexpired terms will be filled by the same nominating and election procedure as for full terms.
Changes (5 of 8)

Tenure Cases:

For the purpose of considering each tenure case, a Joint Tenure Committee is formed, consisting of five members from CTAF and the three-member Department Tenure Committee. If the candidate and one of the CTAF members are from the same department, then that CTAF member is recused from the Joint Tenure Committee automatically. The Joint Committee shall also consider whether any of its members should be recused due to direct conflict of interest. In the event of no departmental overlap or conflict of interest, the selection of the five CTAF members to sit on the Joint Tenure Committee will be governed by CTAF procedures developed to lead to an overall pattern of recusals distributed over the CTAF membership so as to ensure appropriate participation for each CTAF member. **If recusal of two CTAF members is necessary, the most recent qualified past chair of CTAF will serve for that particular case.** The Joint Tenure Committee is chaired by the senior elected member of the five CTAF participants. Normally, each Department Tenure Committee consists of two elected department members with tenure plus the Department Head; in the cases of interdepartmental or interdisciplinary candidates the structure of the Department Tenure Committee shall be modified as explained in Appendix A, Section B2. In the event that recusal of one of the Department Tenure Committee members is necessary due to conflict of interest, the most recent qualified past Department Tenure Committee member will serve on the Joint Tenure Committee for that particular case.
Academic Freedom Cases:
CTAF is also charged with the responsibility of reviewing problems involving the academic freedom of both tenured and non-tenured faculty, whether part time or full time. At the start of a particular academic freedom case, CTAF shall consider whether any of its members should be recused due to direct conflict of interest. If a Committee member is recused, the review will proceed with the remaining members. In the event that CTAF is unsuccessful in the resolution of such problems, the subsequent procedures as well as the procedures to be followed in the granting of tenure will be those in the report of the Ad Hoc Committee on Tenure approved by the Trustees in June, 1968, and procedural amendments proposed in the Tenure Committee Report, 1968-69, and approved by the Faculty on March 17, 1969. (These reports are appended to this document as Appendix A) described in this Faculty Handbook.
Changes (7 of 8)

Text to be deleted from PART ONE, Appendix A (Report of the ad hoc Tenure Committee), Section D (Procedural Amendments):

The Chair of CTAF shall be the member whose term of office expires in June of the current academic year. The Chair shall rule on all matters of procedure and shall be responsible for interpreting all Faculty rules regarding tenure. The Chair's rulings are subject to review by the Faculty only. The Secretary shall be the member whose term of office expires in June of the following academic year. All four members of CTAF must be present to conduct official business.

......
Text to be deleted from PART ONE, Appendix A (Report of the ad hoc Tenure Committee), Section B (Procedure for Granting Tenure); Subsection 2 (Joint Tenure):

CTAF shall be composed of six Faculty Members having tenure who shall be elected by the Faculty, by secret ballot, under the direction of the Secretary of Faculty. Department Heads and Deans are not eligible for membership on this Committee, and there shall not be more than one member from any one department. No member may serve successive terms.
Rationale

Clarify criteria for Chair and Secretary
Update CTAF charge for Professors of Teaching
Clarify nature of recommendations to Provost
Reorganize and edit current description of CTAF

Increase CTAF members from six to nine
• About 30 new Professors of Teaching
• About 15 more planned for this year
• Overall growth in TT faculty by about 15%